

Supplementary Material for
The Deep Feed-Forward Gaussian Process: An Effective Generalization
to Covariance Priors

Melih Kandemir and Fred A. Hamprecht
Heidelberg University, HCI/IWR

Editor: Afshin Rostamizadeh

1. Variational Lower Bound for Classification

Given the variational lower bound \mathcal{L}_r for continuous output, the lower bound for binary output can be calculated by adding the Bernoulli-Probit likelihood $p(\mathbf{t}|\mathbf{y}) = \prod_{n=1}^N \text{Bernoulli}(t_n|\Phi(y_n))$ to the model, and marginalizing out \mathbf{y} . The marginal likelihood for the GP classifier can be bounded by $p(\mathbf{t}|\mathbf{Z}, \mathbf{X}) \geq \int \exp(\mathcal{L}_r) p(\mathbf{t}|\mathbf{y}) d\mathbf{y}$. After taking this integral, the lower bound becomes

$$\begin{aligned} \log p(\mathbf{t}|\mathbf{Z}, \mathbf{X}) \geq \mathcal{L}_c &= \mathcal{L}_r + \sum_n t_n \log \Phi\left(\frac{\mathbf{m}^T \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZZ}}^{-1} \mathbb{E}[\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZB}_n}]}{\sqrt{\beta^{-1} + 1}}\right) \\ &\quad + \sum_n t_n \mathbb{I}(t_n = 1) \frac{\beta}{2} (\mathbf{m}^T \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZZ}}^{-1} \mathbb{E}[\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZB}}])^2 + \sum_n t_n \mathbb{I}(t_n = -1) \log \sqrt{\frac{2\pi}{\beta}}, \end{aligned}$$

where $\mathbb{I}(\cdot)$ is the indicator function.

2. Variational Update Rules

For regression, a mean-field update is tractable for $q(\mathbf{u}) = \mathcal{N}(\mathbf{u}|\mathbf{m}, \mathbf{S})$ as follows

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{S} &= \left(\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZZ}}^{-1} + \beta \sum_n^N \text{tr}\{\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZZ}}^{-1} \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}}[\mathbf{k}_{\mathbf{ZB}} \mathbf{k}_{\mathbf{ZB}}^T] \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZZ}}^{-1}\} \right)^{-1}, \\ \mathbf{m} &= \beta \mathbf{S} \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZZ}}^{-1} \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}}[\mathbf{k}_{\mathbf{ZB}}] \mathbf{y}. \end{aligned}$$

However, for classification, this update should be done gradient-based, since \mathbf{m} also appears in the Bernoulli-Probit likelihood in a non-conjugate way. The related gradient equations are

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial \mathcal{L}_c}{\partial \mathbf{m}} &= -\beta \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZZ}}^{-1} \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}}[\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZB}} \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZB}}^T] \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZZ}}^{-1} \mathbf{m} - \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZZ}}^{-1} \mathbf{m} \\ &\quad + \sum_{n=1}^N \mathbb{I}(t_n = 1) \beta \left(\mathbf{m}^T \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZZ}}^{-1} \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}}[\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZB}_n}] \right) \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZZ}}^{-1} \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}}[\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZB}_n}] \\ &\quad + \sum_{n=1}^N t_n \frac{\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZZ}}^{-1} \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}}[\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZB}_n}]}{\sqrt{2\pi}(\beta^{-1} + 1) \Phi\left(\frac{\mathbf{m}^T \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZZ}}^{-1} \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}}[\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZB}_n}]}{\sqrt{\beta^{-1} + 1}}\right)}, \end{aligned}$$

and

$$\frac{\partial \mathcal{L}_c}{\partial \mathbf{S}} = -\frac{1}{2} \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1} + \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{S}^{-T} - \frac{\beta}{2} \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1} \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}} [\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}} \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}}^T] \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1}.$$

For both regression and classification, the gradient of the lower bound with respect to \mathbf{c}_r is

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial \mathcal{L}_r}{\partial \mathbf{c}_r} = & -\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{X}_{ir} \mathbf{X}_{ir}}^{-1} \mathbf{c}_r + \beta \mathbf{y}^T \frac{\partial \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}} [\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}}]^T}{\partial \mathbf{c}_r} \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1} \mathbf{m} \\ & - \frac{\beta}{2} \text{tr} \left\{ \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1} \frac{\partial \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}} [\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}} \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}}^T]}{\partial \mathbf{c}_r} \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1} (\mathbf{m} \mathbf{m}^T + \mathbf{S}) \right\} \\ & - \frac{\beta}{2} \text{tr} \left\{ \frac{\partial \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}} [\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{B}\mathbf{B}}]}{\partial \mathbf{c}_r} - \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1} \frac{\partial \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}} [\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}} \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}}^T]}{\partial \mathbf{c}_r} \right\}. \end{aligned}$$

We learn the inducing points by optimizing the lower bound with respect to each entry of \mathbf{Z} . The derivative of the lower bound with respect to the inducing point p of DoF r for regression is

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial \mathcal{L}_r}{\partial z_{pr}} = & \beta \mathbf{y}^T \left(\frac{\partial \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}} [\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}_n}]^T}{\partial z_{pr}} \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1} + \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}} [\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}_n}]^T \frac{\partial \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1}}{\partial z_{pr}} \right) \mathbf{m} \\ & - \frac{\beta}{2} \text{tr} \left\{ \left(\frac{\partial \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1}}{\partial z_{pr}} \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}} [\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}} \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}}^T] \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1} + \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1} \frac{\partial \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}} [\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}} \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}}^T]}{\partial z_{pr}} \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1} \right. \right. \\ & \quad \left. \left. + \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1} \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}} [\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}_n} \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}_n}^T] \frac{\partial \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1}}{\partial z_{pr}} \right) (\mathbf{m} \mathbf{m}^T + \mathbf{S}) \right\} \\ & + \frac{\beta}{2} \text{tr} \left\{ \frac{\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1}}{\partial z_{pr}} \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}} [\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}} \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}}^T] + \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1} \frac{\partial \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}} [\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}} \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}}^T]}{\partial z_{pr}} \right\} \\ & - \frac{1}{2} \text{tr} \left(\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1} \frac{\partial \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}}{\partial z_{pr}} + \frac{\partial \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1}}{\partial z_{pr}} \mathbf{S} \right) - \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{m}^T \frac{\partial \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1}}{\partial z_{pr}} \mathbf{m}. \end{aligned} \quad (1)$$

For classification, this derivative is

$$\frac{\partial \mathcal{L}_c}{\partial z_{pr}} = \frac{\partial \mathcal{L}_r}{\partial z_{pr}} + \sum_{n=1}^N t_n \frac{\mathcal{N}(F_n | 0, 1)}{\Phi(F_n)} + \sum_{n=1}^N t_n \frac{\partial F_n}{\partial z_{pr}} + \sum_{n=1}^N \mathbb{I}(t_n = 1) \beta F_n \frac{\partial F_n}{\partial z_{pr}}, \quad (2)$$

where $F_n = \frac{\mathbf{m}^T \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1} \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}} [\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}_n}]}{\sqrt{\beta^{-1} + 1}}$ and

$$\frac{\partial F_n}{\partial z_{pr}} = \mathbf{m}^T \left(\frac{\partial \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1}}{\partial z_{pr}} \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}} [\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}_n}] + \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{Z}}^{-1} \frac{\partial \mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}} [\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{Z}\mathbf{B}_n}]}{\partial z_{pr}} \right).$$

Given a Gaussian kernel function $k(\mathbf{z}, \boldsymbol{\mu}) = \exp\{-\frac{1}{2}(\mathbf{z} - \boldsymbol{\mu})^T \mathbf{J}^{-1} (\mathbf{z} - \boldsymbol{\mu})\}$, which could be isotropic as in the radial basis function (RBF), diagonal as in Automatic Relevance Determination (ARD), or a full matrix as in metric learning, hyperparameters \mathbf{J} can also be fit by gradient ascent. The derivatives of the variational log-likelihood with respect to the kernel hyperparameters are as in Equations 1 and 2. It suffices to replace all ∂z_{pr} s in these formulas with $\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}$.

3. RBF Kernel for Random Inputs

For a Radial Basis Function $k(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') = \exp\{-\frac{1}{2}(\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}')^T \mathbf{J}^{-1}(\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}')\}$, static input vectors \mathbf{z} and \mathbf{z}' , and the random vector \mathbf{x} which follows the multivariate normal distribution $\mathcal{N}(\mathbf{x}|\boldsymbol{\mu}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma})$,

$$\begin{aligned}\mathbb{E}_{p(\mathbf{x}|\boldsymbol{\mu}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma})}[k(\mathbf{z}, \mathbf{x})] &= |\mathbf{J}^{-1}\boldsymbol{\Sigma} + \mathbf{I}|^{-\frac{1}{2}} \times \exp \left\{ -\frac{1}{2}\mathbf{z}^T(\mathbf{J} + \boldsymbol{\Sigma})^{-1}\mathbf{z} - \frac{1}{2}\boldsymbol{\mu}^T(\mathbf{J} + \boldsymbol{\Sigma})^{-1}\boldsymbol{\mu} \right. \\ &\quad \left. + \mathbf{z}^T\mathbf{J}^{-1}(\mathbf{J}^{-1} + \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1})^{-1}\boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1}\boldsymbol{\mu} \right\},\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}\mathbb{E}_{p(\mathbf{x}|\boldsymbol{\mu}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma})}[k(\mathbf{z}_p, \mathbf{x})k(\mathbf{z}_{p'}, \mathbf{x})] &= |2\mathbf{J}^{-1}\boldsymbol{\Sigma} + \mathbf{I}|^{-\frac{1}{2}} \times \exp \left\{ -\frac{1}{2}\mathbf{z}_p^T(\mathbf{J}^{-1} - \mathbf{J}^{-1}(2\mathbf{J}^{-1} + \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1})^{-1}\mathbf{J}^{-1})\mathbf{z}_p \right. \\ &\quad - \frac{1}{2}\mathbf{z}_{p'}^T(\mathbf{J}^{-1} - \mathbf{J}^{-1}(2\mathbf{J}^{-1} + \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1})^{-1}\mathbf{J}^{-1})\mathbf{z}_{p'} - \frac{1}{2}\boldsymbol{\mu}^T(\boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1} - \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1}(2\mathbf{J}^{-1} + \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1})^{-1}\boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1})\boldsymbol{\mu} \\ &\quad \left. + (\mathbf{z}_p + \mathbf{z}_{p'})^T\mathbf{J}^{-1}(2\mathbf{J}^{-1} + \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1})^{-1}\boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1}\boldsymbol{\mu} + \mathbf{z}_p^T\mathbf{J}^{-1}(2\mathbf{J}^{-1} + \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1})^{-1}\mathbf{J}^{-1}\mathbf{z}_{p'} \right\}.\end{aligned}$$

The derivatives of the stochastic Gaussian kernel with respect to an inducing point entry z_{pr} are

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{\partial \mathbb{E}_{p(\mathbf{x}|\boldsymbol{\mu}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma})}[k(\mathbf{z}_p, \boldsymbol{\mu})]}{\partial z_{pr}} &= \mathbb{E}_{p(\mathbf{x}|\boldsymbol{\mu}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma})}[k(\mathbf{z}_p, \boldsymbol{\mu})] \left(-\mathbf{z}_p^T\mathbf{J}^{-1} - \mathbf{J}^{-1}(\boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1} + \mathbf{J}^{-1})^{-1}\mathbf{J}^{-1} \right. \\ &\quad \left. + \boldsymbol{\mu}^T\boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1}(\boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1} + \mathbf{J}^{-1})^{-1}\mathbf{J}^{-1} \frac{\partial \mathbf{z}_p}{\partial z_{pr}} \right),\end{aligned}$$

and

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{\partial \mathbb{E}_{p(\mathbf{x}|\boldsymbol{\mu}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma})}[k(\mathbf{z}_p, \boldsymbol{\mu})k(\mathbf{z}_{p'}, \boldsymbol{\mu})]}{\partial z_{pr}} &= \mathbb{E}_{p(\mathbf{x}|\boldsymbol{\mu}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma})}[k(\mathbf{z}_p, \boldsymbol{\mu})k(\mathbf{z}_{p'}, \boldsymbol{\mu})] \\ &\quad \times \left(-\mathbf{z}_p^T(\mathbf{J}^{-1} - \mathbf{J}^{-1}(2\mathbf{J}^{-1} + \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1})^{-1}\mathbf{J}^{-1}) \frac{\partial \mathbf{z}_p}{\partial z_{pr}} \right. \\ &\quad + \left(\frac{\partial \mathbf{z}_p}{\partial z_{pr}} + \mathbf{z}_{p'} \right)^T \mathbf{J}^{-1}(2\mathbf{J}^{-1} + \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1})^{-1}\boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1}\boldsymbol{\mu} \\ &\quad \left. + \mathbf{z}_{p'}^T\mathbf{J}^{-1}(2\mathbf{J}^{-1} + \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1})^{-1}\mathbf{J}^{-1} \frac{\partial \mathbf{z}_p}{\partial z_{pr}} \right)\end{aligned}$$

for $p \neq p'$. Since $k(\mathbf{z}_p, \mathbf{z}_{p'}) = 1$, this second derivative will be 0 for $p = p'$. For the same reason, the derivatives of $\mathbb{E}_{p(\mathbf{b}_n|\boldsymbol{\mu}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_n)}[k(\mathbf{b}_n, \mathbf{b}_n)]$ with respect to z_{pr} , and \mathbf{c}_r and \mathbf{J}_{ij} are also all 0. The gradients with respect to $\boldsymbol{\mu}$ are

$$\frac{\partial \mathbb{E}_{p(\mathbf{x}|\boldsymbol{\mu}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_n)}[k(\mathbf{z}_p, \boldsymbol{\mu})]}{\partial \boldsymbol{\mu}} = \mathbb{E}_{p(\mathbf{x}|\boldsymbol{\mu}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_n)}[k(\mathbf{z}_p, \boldsymbol{\mu})] \left(-(\mathbf{J} + \boldsymbol{\Sigma})^{-1}\boldsymbol{\mu} + \mathbf{z}^T\mathbf{J}^{-1}(\mathbf{J}^{-1} + \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1})^{-1}\boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1} \right).$$

and

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{\partial \mathbb{E}_{p(\mathbf{x}|\boldsymbol{\mu}_n, \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_n)}[k(\mathbf{z}_p, \boldsymbol{\mu})k(\mathbf{z}_{p'}, \boldsymbol{\mu})]}{\partial \boldsymbol{\mu}} &= \mathbb{E}_{p(\boldsymbol{\mu}|\boldsymbol{\mu}_n, \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_n)}[k(\mathbf{z}_p, \boldsymbol{\mu})k(\mathbf{z}_{p'}, \boldsymbol{\mu})] \\ &\quad \times \left(-(\boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1} - \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1}(2\mathbf{J}^{-1} + \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1})^{-1}\boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1})\boldsymbol{\mu} \right. \\ &\quad \left. + (\mathbf{z}_p + \mathbf{z}_{p'})^T\mathbf{J}^{-1}(2\mathbf{J}^{-1} + \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1})^{-1}\boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1} \right).\end{aligned}$$

Given the equations above, the derivatives of $\mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}}[\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZB}}]$ and $\mathbb{E}_{Q_{AB}}[\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZB}}\mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{ZB}}^T]$ with respect to \mathbf{c}_r could simply be taken using $b_{nr} = \mathbf{k}_{\mathbf{X}_{ir}\mathbf{x}_n}^T \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{X}_{ir}\mathbf{x}_n}^{-1} \mathbf{c}_r$ and

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{b}_n}{\partial c_{pr}} = \mathbf{e}_p^T \mathbf{K}_{\mathbf{X}_{ir}\mathbf{x}_n}^{-1} \mathbf{c}_r$$

together with the chain rule. Here, \mathbf{e}_p is a $P \times 1$ vector whose p th entry is 1 and other entries are 0. The integer P stands for the number of inducing points.

Finally, the gradients with respect to the hyperparameter \mathbf{J}_{ij} are

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial \mathbb{E}_{p(\mathbf{x}|\boldsymbol{\mu}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma})}[k(\mathbf{z}_p, \boldsymbol{\mu})]}{\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}} = & \mathbb{E}_{p(\mathbf{x}|\boldsymbol{\mu}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma})}[k(\mathbf{z}_p, \boldsymbol{\mu})] \left(-\frac{1}{2} |\mathbf{J}^{-1}\boldsymbol{\Sigma} + \mathbf{I}|^{-\frac{3}{2}} \text{tr}\left((\mathbf{J}^{-1}\boldsymbol{\Sigma} + \mathbf{I}) \frac{\partial \mathbf{J}^{-1}}{\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}}\right) \right. \\ & - \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{z}^T \frac{\partial \mathbf{J}^{-1}}{\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}} \mathbf{z} - \mathbf{z}^T \mathbf{J}^{-1} (\mathbf{J}^{-1} + \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1}) \frac{\partial \mathbf{J}^{-1}}{\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}} \mathbf{z} \\ & - \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{z}^T \mathbf{J}^{-1} \frac{\partial \mathbf{J}^{-1}}{\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}} \mathbf{J}^{-1} \mathbf{z} - \frac{1}{2} \boldsymbol{\mu}^T \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1} \frac{\partial \mathbf{J}^{-1}}{\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}} \boldsymbol{\Sigma} \mathbf{J}^{-1} \boldsymbol{\mu} \\ & \left. + \mathbf{z}^T \frac{\partial \mathbf{J}^{-1}}{\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}} (\mathbf{J}^{-1}\boldsymbol{\Sigma} + \mathbf{I}) \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1} \boldsymbol{\mu} + \mathbf{z}^T \mathbf{J}^{-1} \frac{\partial \mathbf{J}^{-1}}{\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}} \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1} \boldsymbol{\mu} \right), \end{aligned}$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial \mathbb{E}_{p(\mathbf{x}|\boldsymbol{\mu}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma})}[k(\mathbf{z}_p, \boldsymbol{\mu})k(\mathbf{z}_{p'}, \boldsymbol{\mu})]}{\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}} = & \mathbb{E}_{p(\mathbf{x}|\boldsymbol{\mu}, \boldsymbol{\Sigma})}[k(\mathbf{z}_p, \boldsymbol{\mu})k(\mathbf{z}_{p'}, \boldsymbol{\mu})] \times \\ & \left(-\frac{1}{2} |2\mathbf{J}^{-1}\boldsymbol{\Sigma} + \mathbf{I}|^{-\frac{3}{2}} \text{tr}\left((2\mathbf{J}^{-1}\boldsymbol{\Sigma} + \mathbf{I}) \frac{\partial \mathbf{J}^{-1}}{\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}}\right) - \frac{1}{2} \boldsymbol{\mu}^T \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1} \frac{\partial \mathbf{J}^{-1}}{\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}} \boldsymbol{\Sigma} \mathbf{J}^{-1} \boldsymbol{\mu} \right. \\ & - \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{z}_p^T \left(\frac{\partial \mathbf{J}^{-1}}{\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}} + 2\mathbf{J}^{-1}(\mathbf{J}^{-1} + \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1}) \frac{\partial \mathbf{J}^{-1}}{\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}} + \mathbf{J}^{-1} \frac{\partial \mathbf{J}^{-1}}{\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}} \mathbf{J}^{-1} \right) \mathbf{z}_p \\ & - \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{z}_{p'}^T \left(\frac{\partial \mathbf{J}^{-1}}{\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}} + 2\mathbf{J}^{-1}(\mathbf{J}^{-1} + \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1}) \frac{\partial \mathbf{J}^{-1}}{\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}} + \mathbf{J}^{-1} \frac{\partial \mathbf{J}^{-1}}{\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}} \mathbf{J}^{-1} \right) \mathbf{z}_{p'} \\ & \left. + (\mathbf{z}_p + \mathbf{z}_{p'})^T \left(\frac{\partial \mathbf{J}^{-1}}{\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}} (\mathbf{J}^{-1}\boldsymbol{\Sigma} + \mathbf{I}) \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1} \boldsymbol{\mu} + \mathbf{J}^{-1} \frac{\partial \mathbf{J}^{-1}}{\partial \mathbf{J}_{ij}} \boldsymbol{\Sigma}^{-1} \boldsymbol{\mu} \right) \right). \end{aligned}$$